

Conducting: Robert DePoe, CMAC Chair
Minutes taken by: Amanda Charlesworth

August 26, 2010 CMAC Minutes

Attendance Record: Jeanette Misaka, Aida Santos-Mattingley, Jean Tokuda Irwin, Freddie Cooper, Ike Spencer, Hector Mendiola, Robert DePoe, Sharee Varela, Charlene Lui, Soulee L.K.O. Stroud, Richard Gomez, Edie Park, Brenda Burrell, Chuck Foster, Jeff Ojeda, Amanda Charlesworth, Linda Oda, Dave Rodemack, and Susan May

Excused: George Henry, Christina Morales, Debbie Corsino-Moore, Clara Helen Bedonie, Martell Menlove, Rita Brock, and Lillian Tsosie-Jensen

Welcome – Robert DePoe

- Bypassed Cultural Reverence today.

Item #1: Approval of June 24, 2010 meeting minutes – Robert DePoe

- 1st – Jeanette Misaka
- 2nd - Soulee L.K.O. Stroud
- Motion Carried.

Item #2: USOE Hiring Practices Update – Dave Rodemack and Susan May, USOE HR

- **Dave Rodemack** – Thank you to CMAC for all the help they have provided to USOE HR with the hiring practices. He welcomes the addition of more CMAC members to that team. He looks to CMAC for suggestions that will lead to better outcomes. He is going to turn the time over to Susan May who actually does the hiring process at USOE.
- **Susan May** – USOE Hiring Process: USOE has an online application/hiring process. 1st step is the hiring supervisor puts together the job description. That information is put into the recruiting system. At that point she will create an application. The application will ask for the highest level of education. The skills required are subject to change based on the specialty of that position. Other requirements/skills will be asked as well, such as years of experience in an Education related field. The Ed. Specialist and above positions require the applicant has a Utah Educators License. Once the recruitment closes Susan creates a file of the applicants based on the hiring criteria. If the supervisor asks for a certain number of years of experience that is one of the filters that will be used. Once she filters out the applications based on the hiring criteria, she will print those applications and take them to the hiring supervisor. The hiring supervisors are the ones who will read through the applications and ensure that that experience, education, etc. is what they are looking for. Then they will call for interviews.
- **Jean Irwin** – One of the things she sees a lot is specific criteria detailed for a specific person who is in mind and the other applicants would be filtered out. How do you ensure that practice doesn't happen?
- **Dave Rodemack** – They try to help the hiring supervisor devise appropriate application questions to ensure an open field and they are required to interview more than one applicant.
- **Jean Irwin** – If they hire the one who was expected do they have to explain why?
- **Dave Rodemack** – Yes.
- **Jeanette Misaka** – Do any of the questions ask about diversity?
- **Susan May** – She does not usually ask that question unless the position is going to deal with diverse populations specifically.
- **Jeanette Misaka** – Is there an option down the line to ask such a question about equity?
- **Susan May** – During the interview process the question could be asked, but again the questions are focused on the job requirements.
- **Soulee L.K.O. Stroud** – Do you have any way that if someone applied and their Utah license is pending can they move forward in the application process?
- **Susan May** – If the applicant has already completed the application process or renewal process they may continue. Some out of state licenses do not transfer as easily as others, so she will check with the licensing department if there are any questions of the time line. There is a dialogue box the applicant can add that detail into.
- **Robert DePoe** – Are there any kind of indicators as to how many minorities are applying?
- **Dave Rodemack** – That information does not come to us. The info does come after the fact in a group report, but the data is self reported and not always accurate.
- **Robert DePoe** – It would be helpful if CMAC could have that data to see if we are getting the applicants to USOE.

- **Dave Rodemack** – The data window is only a 30 day period. The last four positions that USOE hired were support staff. He hopes to get more data from DHRM regarding the Specialist positions.
- **Soulee L.K.O. Stroud** – Do you have a breakdown for those who were screened?
- **Dave Rodemack** – It would be pretty much impossible to get, they could do an observer identification and keep a hand written copy of that info, but no definite data would be available.
- **Robert DePoe** – Freddie Cooper could your subcommittee take on this requirement and report on that data quarterly? Please get with your committee and work with HR.
- **Freddie Cooper** – Yes.
- **Charlene Lui** – When she sat on the interview committee the statement was made that if the applicant misspells or doesn't complete the application the application is not processed. Do you use criteria like that?
- **Susan May** – If they don't complete the application process the application will not be counted. Each applicant must read the instructions and complete the entire process. A lot of that will depend on the position, especially for support staff, if there are errors that is going to be a concern for them.
- **Dave Rodemack** – HR relies on CMAC via Richard Gomez to get the word out about the USOE openings. They are wondering if any CMAC members know applicants, if so please inform HR so they can help "shepherd" that applicant along so they get to the level they won't be screened out. Just email Susan the name and HR can help make sure that applicant has all the pieces to complete the application.
- **Jean Irwin** – Has an issue with that, she wants the process to be fair and equitable. The real problem she sees is when a hiring is tailored for a specific applicant. If the person doesn't have the skills that's okay with her if they don't make it through the application process.
- **Charlene Lui** – It took her by surprise, the way it was said at that time she took it as a flippant issue not a chronic spelling issue. She is thinking of the refugee populations that won't be familiar with the computer application process etc.
- **Dave Rodemack** – HR would take time with any applicant who called in to check their application. But they can only do that if the applicant contacts them. So his suggestion is for CMAC to encourage people to call HR and get the help they need to apply.
- **Robert DePoe** – That is where CMAC will be useful.
- **Susan May** – Until the recruitment closes the applicant can make changes.
- **Freddie Cooper** – USOE does not download the applicants until the opening closes?
- **Dave Rodemack** – That is correct, they may update the supervisor as to how many applied but that's all.
- **Sharee Varela** – Were the Native American applicants qualified?
- **Dave Rodemack** – HR does not have that information until they walk into the interview.
- **Susan May** – Once the hiring is ready to go, it's up to the hiring supervisor to come up with the interview questions based on the essential requirements of the job, they also give Susan an idea of the skills they are looking for. She always asks the hiring supervisors to give a week notice to get members from CMAC and so the candidate has time to prepare also. During the interviews she may or may not be on the interview committee. Sometimes they recruit District personnel to be on the interview committee as that's who the specialist would be working with.
- **Freddie Cooper** – The CMAC interview sub-committee has several questions prepared to suggest. They tried to figure out how the questions would fit into an interview. There were some questions that were submitted that made them concerned about the sensitivity and liability of them. Some of those questions were deleted, there should be five questions.
- **Susan May** – Her suggestion to implement these questions is to send them a copy of these questions and ask the hiring supervisor to consider those questions as part of their interview question list, but it would be up to the hiring supervisor whether or not they are used.
- **Dave Rodemack** – HR may get to the point that they just require the hiring supervisor to choose at least one from the list.
- **Robert DePoe** – Please give CMAC a month to continue word smithing these questions. He would like to thank the sub-committee for their hard work; they've done a great job.
- **Richard Gomez** – This is a voluntary effort to respond to CMAC's recommendations to open jobs to all qualified applicants. One of the key things is the questions asked in the interview. It's been his experience that most administrators are not prepared to develop their own questions related to these issues. That's why these questions need to be as generic as possible to be used across the board. The questions wording may need to be altered, but at least one of those questions needs to be asked on the interview. It's CMAC's prerogative to ask USOE to incorporate at least one of these questions into the process.

- **Robert DePoe** – He appreciates the openness from HR and he feels we have a good working relationship. The goal is to help the students, they advocate for, to be successful.
- **Dave Rodemack** – Thank you CMAC and the interview sub-committee.
- **Richard Gomez** – When the questions first came in they were reflecting the person's own feelings, but he wants to applaud the committee for making them general enough to be used in all interviews. Kudos to the sub-committee.
- **Robert DePoe** – Next step is for all of CMAC to review those questions. Coordinate with Robert and the questions should be submitted to HR in the next month.
- **Dave Rodemack** – When would you like him to report on the data?
 - October's CMAC meeting.

Item #3: Call for CMAC Nominees to fill upcoming vacancies – Richard Gomez

- It's time to get the process started with the board. Those who are due, your name, if you choose, would have to be resubmitted:
 - Aida Santos-Mattingly
 - Debbie Corsino-Moore
 - Hector Mendiola
 - George Henry
- Those members need to email Amanda Charlesworth and indicate if you want your name submitted for the vacancies.
- There is a vacancy currently for a Pacific Islander representative. The board will make their selection at the next meeting; this should be done before the next CMAC meeting. The name will be announced at that time, they should be able to attend the October CMAC meeting.
- There is a process to become an applicant, please contact us should you need information.
- Hopefully you will encourage others to apply. The community organizations have been contacted and will get a 2nd call for nominees shortly.
- **Jean Irwin** – If the applicant has travel would that be reimbursed?
- **Richard Gomez** – No, the board has not indicated they have a budget to do so.

Item #4: Federal Race & Ethnicity Data Collection Sub-Committee – Charlene Lui

- On August 9th Soulee and Charlene along with Richard, Edie and Amanda attended the Charter Schools Director's meeting.
 - Thank you Amanda for all the updates and preparing the handouts.
 - We reviewed the CMAC brochure and PowerPoint.
 - There was some discussion on immigration etc. some of the same questions that have been asked previously.
- **Jean Irwin** – Shared this with Utah PTA, she forwarded them the website and the PDF Parent Brochure. They are hoping to share this info with the 20 region directors from around the state. They will inform them they can contact CMAC should they have additional questions.
- **Charlene Lui** – The sub-committee met again to continue to define the categories.
 - **Main problem is the Hispanic population doesn't feel comfortable answering #2.**
 - As a sub-committee trainers are:
 - Debbie Corsino-Moore
 - Soulee L.K.O. Stroud
 - Jeanette Misaka
 - **Please ask one of the sub-committee members to come with you to present to help stay on target.**
- **Richard Gomez** – You did a great job at the Charter School Director's meeting. He suggests that CMAC hold a town meeting with community groups, the PTA and others to get feedback. If there is any specific area that has a disproportionate number of observer identification that will send up a red flag.
- **Ike Spencer** – Do the schools have the authority to alter these documents? If you're not actually using the same documents how are you going to validate your results from that?
- **Richard Gomez** – Because this was not mandated by the Federal Government as time goes on that may be an issue.
- **Charlene Lui** – Granite asked for all the info but in only one question. Their IT dept. feels that will get the answers needed.

- **Brenda Burrell** – Because of the political issues it will be interesting to see how the groups change as these results came back. There has been a move in the Ogden area to have all Hispanic's check Caucasian and check NO on Hispanic.
- **Charlene Lui** – After the October counts come in it will be interesting to see if we have some major numbers shift.
- **Richard Gomez** – John Brandt at USOE will have info on those stats. He will talk to John and see how early they could have a report ready, possibly December.
- **Robert DePoe** – Again he thanks the sub-committee for all the hard work and the effort put in to travel and present on this issue.
- **Soulee L.K.O. Stroud** – At the Charter Directors meeting, the use of illegal aliens was going around, do we need to put together something to use in the trainings? Thankfully Richard got up and explained the terms incorrectness and necessity to use Undocumented.
 - The Charter Schools Board Meeting: 72 Charter Schools in Utah as of that meeting.
 - He would like to see a map of where they are.
 - There is a new charter opening that is devoted to lower income Hispanic families. That school should open next year. It seems like they are saying the right things to reach that group, but he feels CMAC needs to keep an eye on this as it develops.
 - A question was raised by the Chair Tom Morgan, who asked Cory Kanth who is USOE staff. As you observe the Charter Schools and how they've developed.
 - Charters didn't anticipate budget cuts.
 - There needs to be clarification to the budgets and how the money is to be used.
 - Beehive Academy is battling with the board to keep their charter, but they don't have a physical building as of two weeks ago.
- **Jean Irwin** – She is involved with Beehive Academy, they have a new location in Cottonwood. They feel as though they are under the eye of the Board due to the Islamic enrollment and facility.
- **Soulee L.K.O. Stroud** - The other items is that they are looking at some of the standards for financial and operational.
 - His overall feelings about the meeting is that he was just an observer.
 - Marlies said she would communicate with Ike Spencer, but that has not happened yet.
 - Richard will follow up.
- **Charlene Lui** – History: CMAC was not included initially due to politics, but Marlies Burns wanted the CMAC representation and helped move that issue forward.
- **Richard Gomez** – Maybe suggest to Marlies that the CMAC member does an intro of who CMAC is and what they do.

Item #5: 2011 Utah Equity in Action Conference Update Report – Richard Gomez

- Confirmed location – U of U Ballroom and 10 meeting rooms with the option of 3 rooms free of use in the MBH. There are not rooms reserved yet in the OSH due to reservation limitations and registration process timelines.
- The EAC BUENO Center has committed \$17,000 of their resources and the option to use professionals from other EAC's across the nation.
- Ed. Equity has committed \$4000 and the U of U's Ed. Dept. committed \$2000. The districts are considering sponsoring registration fees. Stipends are still being considered in some districts. We have a commitment from the Pearson's organization but that application is still in process.
- **Charlene Lui** – She didn't realize she would be reporting on this, for the Program and Breakout sub-committee they are considering four strands. One possible strand is a parent component, but they don't want to disrupt the parent conferences going on. They are hoping to bring in some of the community leaders. They would also like to have a parent panel Q and A session with the educators and administrators as the audience. We are also working with Dawn Stevenson on the Utah Futures website. There would be a computer lab for parents to have hands on access. Another strand would be equity in leadership. They are looking at bringing in some of the national speakers on these issues. Another strand would be culturally responsive teaching; they are looking to work with the U of U for the Critical Race Theory and their specialist in that area. The other strand related to an over identification of students in Special Ed. and no kids getting accommodations in Section 504.
 - In looking for sponsorship you may see sponsors presenting, but the committee will be very careful as to who is approved to present.
 - **Jean Irwin** – Would you have time for performances? (Jean's program could fund performers.)

- **Richard Gomez** – Our boss Deputy Supt. Menlove was there. He got so excited after the steering committee meeting that he is hopeful he can get money from Superintendent Shumway to help the conference.
- **Charlene Lui** – Is there a way to sponsor all CMAC members to attend?
- **Richard Gomez** – YES we will find a way to get all the CMAC members to the conference.
- **Jean Irwin** – Please make sure the parent strand is really strong.
- **Richard Gomez** – His hopes are that districts will select parents to send to the conference.

Item #6: Legislative Committee – Ike Spencer/Charlene Lui

- Charlene, Debbie, Ike and Freddie met and discussed the issues with HB166/testing changes.
 - Background: The Blue Ribbon Committee has been disbanded but the work goes on.
 - The ACT is going into practice this year; the state is going to pay for all 11th graders to test, but only specific 8th graders to test and the state will only pay for the 1st time each student tests.
- **Ike Spencer** – The ACT guidelines are very specific as to the heights of chairs and distance between desks etc. So this is another case of a mandate that isn't funded that can't be fulfilled.
- **Robert DePoe** – The selected Districts volunteered for this trial testing.
- **Ike Spencer** – The Granite SD principals did not act as though they volunteered.
- **Charlene Lui** – They do have a great website www.act.org they have good preparation help for parents and students.
 - CMAC recommendations – See handout.
- **Robert DePoe** – Thank you, what are the next steps to make this info useful?
- **Brenda Burrell** – Are the results on the student transcripts?
- **Ike Spencer** – The student would have to elect to have that info put on the transcript.
- **Brenda Burrell** – If the scores go on the transcripts that is a permanent legal record that affects students at college admissions etc.
- **Charlene Lui** - When she was on the blue ribbon committee it was to replace the exit test for graduation.
- **Robert DePoe** – The recommendation should be not to use the ACT as any kind of high stakes test.
- **Soulee L.K.O. Stroud** – What do these tests cost to administer?
- **Charlene Lui/Brenda Burrell** – Test costs about \$30-35 to administer per student.
- **Robert DePoe** – Can the sub-committee please have this ready for him to take to the September Board meeting?
- **Charlene Lui** – She will email the updated recommendations.

Item #7: Board Report – Robert DePoe

- Reviewed Bulletin
- **Charlene Lui** – The Nation Indigenous Council made some recommendations that are included in the Common Core Standards, which is nice at a national level.
- **Robert DePoe** – USOE has realigned staff, he will invite Karl Wilson to report next month to explain those changes.
 - He'll ask Karl if there is info necessary to prepare and Robert will send that via email to CMAC.
- **Charlene Lui** – There are CMAC members who have not met Brenda Hales.

Item #8: Comments – Dr. Menlove: Excused

Item #9: State Board Comments – Denis Morrill: Excused

Closing Comments:

- ACT \$33 per student, \$48 with writing piece.
- **Charlene Lui** – Was concerned because there are scholarships available for parapro's to go back and get a full bachelors degree, but the info was not available before the deadline. What bothered her about that, was how does the word get out? She happened upon the info the day before the deadline.
- **Brenda Burrell** – Work with Syd Dickson on this issue to get the info better disseminated.

Adjourned at 1:53pm